**Feedback Table**

Once you become a doctoral candidate and begin completing your milestone documents, you will be required to submit something call a “Change Matrix”. This is a table that notes each comment received on your writing, how you addressed it, and where the issue is in the document. This helps you and your advisor keep track of your work and the major changes made.

It is also an opportunity to ask questions or disagree with feedback. You are working to become an independent scholar, which means you should be an expert in your content area(s). As you have experienced in your literature search, there are a plethora of studies, many reviews, and various different conclusions that have (and can be) drawn from all the scholarly work. In other words, it is normal to disagree and have scholarly debates. However, note the term scholarly debates. I emphasize this, because it is fine to disagree with another academic scholar, but your stance/opinion should be based in the scholarly literature (vs. simply your experience or feelings) and supported by specific data and information.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Faculty’s recommendation, comment, etc.** | **Question regarding feedback, disagreement with feedback, and**  **how feedback will be addressed** | **Page number(s) where comment & change appears in your dissertation draft FACULTY COMMENTS** |
| You need to be more specific. Are you referring to national polls of Americans’ perceptions of “contributions of foreigners”? Or are you referring to evidence from research on the subject matter? | The feedback will be addressed by citing where the information was obtained | Page 1 |
| An immigrant is usually someone who comes to live in the United States in a rather permanent basis, whereas a foreigner can be a non-American citizen enjoying a short vacation in the United States. You need to make sure to define these two terms and explain their similarities and differences. | The feedback will be addressed by focusing mainly on immigrants instead of foreigners and immigrants. | Page 1 |
| I think you meant the opposite. | The point that “Immigrants are less likely to relocate to Ohio due to the *harmonious* policies”, will be changed to “Immigrants are less likely to relocate to Ohio due to the *incongruent* policies” | Page 2 |
| Repetitive! Also, missing an appropriate citation | The repetitive section was removed. | 1The thought or idea is repetitive. The fact that Ohio has inadequate policies that impact the immigrant population. |
| How do you know that? Is this just your opinion? Do others share this opinion? If so, cite these opinions here. | The findings from a study carried out by the Ohio access to justice foundation were cited. | Page 1, 2 |
| Is this evidence for Ohio or for the country as a whole? Make sure to distinguish “evidence” at the state and the national levels. | I believe the distinction was made in the essay. However, I will make adjustments so that is clear whether it is at the state or national level. | 1,2 The point here is that it is important to use explicit language. Do not assume the reader knows the subject matter the same way you do. |
| Same as above. | I believe it was clear in that section that I was referring to the state. The state will be specified to make it clear enough for the reader | See below |
| Likewise, an increase in immigrants' percentage in a State contributes to median income growth (Durell, 2018). Therefore, available information concerning immigration points to immigrants’ possible benefits to Ohio’s financial status and the residents’ economic development. | I believe it was clear in that section that I was referring to the state. The state will be specified to make it clear enough for the reader. | 2You are correct, this section clearly refers to the state of Ohio. My bad! |
| It appears that the mismatch in immigration policies is within the state of Ohio, not between Ohio and the Federal government. If what you intend is the latter, you need to rewrite the introduction to reflect such idea. | The statement was changed to within the Ohio state | Page 2 |
| This is exactly the point I am making above. The discrepancy in policies is within the state. | The above comment was corrected to point out that the discrepancy in policies is within the state | Page 3 |
| Cite the studies! | The source was cited |  |
| What do you mean by seven cases, seven families? | From the initial sections, a reference was made that case studies will be generated for seven families. Hence, I believe the reference, in this case, makes sense. This section will need clarification. | 4 Okay |
| What economic theory do you have in mind? Be more specific! | The economic theory will be highlighted in the study | Page 4 |
| Are policies and initiatives the same thing? If not, do not use different words to mean the same thing. Accuracy in your statements (or wording) is important. It eliminates confusion and misinterpretations. | The word initiative was changed to policies to avoid any confusion | Page 8 |
| Why? | The paragraph was rewritten to included reasons why the study is significant to Ohio’s legislators | Page 9 |
| Is this a mere speculation on your part? Can you back up this statement with evidence from the literature? | Sources were cited to back up the claim | Page 9 |
| Here, you are already concluding that the state is not doing enough for foreigners or immigrants. Are you doing the study to confirm your “suspicions”? Per your own brief research here, there is no conclusive evidence Ohio needs to strengthen its “immigration policy” to improve its “financial position.” | The statement was cited to show that this were findings of another researcher. | Page 9 |
| You need to specify the sector or sectors of the economy you are interested in, rather than going after all the sector in the economy. If you do the latter, five “cases” will not be sufficient to provide any valuable results. | I'm afraid I have to disagree with the assertion that I need to narrow down to specific sectors in the economy. In this section of the study's significance, am explaining how important the study is to the area under study, research question, and the targeted group. In other words, the importance of the study cannot be limited to specific parts of the economy if, in the actual sense, it can cover the whole economy  Two sectors with physically demanding jobs will be included in the study, Health care and retail sectors.  Online surveys and questionnaires will be used to gather data on the number of immigrants working in these two sectors. | 11A couple of things here. First, an economy as diverse as that of the state of Ohio can be overwhelming to deal with. Are you looking at the economy as a whole or by sector? If the later, you need to describe what sectors of the economy you are referring to. Moreover, my guess is that immigrants in the state of Ohio do not impact all the sectors of the economy equally. Hence, my suggestion to focus on those sectors which are significantly impacted. Finally, how do you plan to measure such impact on the economy, by asking immigrants in your sample? |